



## LAWFUL ENFORCEMENT OF LEGAL FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS A BENCH CARD FOR JUDGES

Courts may not incarcerate a defendant/respondent, or revoke probation, for nonpayment of a court-ordered legal financial obligation unless the court holds a hearing and makes one of the following findings:

1. The failure to pay was not due to an inability to pay, but was willful or due to failure to make bona fide efforts to pay; or
2. The failure to pay was not the fault of the defendant/respondent and alternatives to imprisonment are not adequate in a particular situation to meet the State's interest in punishment and deterrence.

If a defendant/respondent fails to pay a court-ordered legal financial obligation but the court, after opportunity for a hearing, finds that the failure to pay was not due to the fault of the defendant/respondent, but rather due to lack of financial resources, the court should consider alternative measures of punishment rather than incarceration. *Bearden v. Georgia*, 461 U.S. 660, 667-669 (1983); *State ex rel. Fleming v. Mo. Bd. of Prob. & Parole*, 515 S.W.3d 224 (Mo. banc 2017). Punishment and deterrence can often be served fully by alternative means to incarceration, including an extension of time to pay, reduction of the amount owed, or community service. *Bearden*, 461 U.S. at 671.

Court-ordered legal financial obligations (LFOs) include all discretionary and mandatory fines, costs, fees, state assessments, and/or restitution in civil and criminal cases.

### **1. Adequate Notice of the Hearing to Determine Ability to Pay<sup>1</sup>**

**Notice should include the following information:**

- a. Hearing date and time;
- b. Total amount claimed due;
- c. That the court will evaluate the person's ability to pay at the hearing;
- d. That the person should bring any documentation or information the court should consider in determining ability to pay;
- e. That incarceration may result only if alternate measures are not adequate to meet the State's interests in punishment and deterrence or the court finds that the person had the ability to pay and willfully refused;
- f. Right to counsel\*; and
- g. That a person unable to pay can request payment alternatives, including, but not limited to, community service and/or a reduction of the amount owed.

### **2. Meaningful Opportunity to Explain at the Hearing<sup>2</sup>**

**The person must have an opportunity to explain:**

- a. Whether the amount charged as due is incorrect; and
- b. The reason(s) for any nonpayment (e.g., inability to pay).

### **3. Factors the Court Should Consider to Determine Willfulness<sup>3</sup>**

- a. Income, including whether income is at or below 125% of the Federal Poverty Guidelines (FPG)<sup>4</sup>

For 2016, 125% of FPG is:	
\$14,850 for an individual;	\$30,375 for a family of 4;
\$20,025 for a family of 2;	\$35,550 for a family of 5;
\$25,200 for a family of 3;	\$40,725 for a family of 6.

- b. Receipt of needs-based, means-tested public assistance, including, but not limited to, Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF), Supplemental Security Income (SSI), Social Security Disability Insurance (SSDI), or veterans' disability benefits (Such benefits are not subject to attachment, garnishment, execution, levy, or other legal process);

<sup>1</sup> Rule 37.65(b)(c); Rule 36.01(b); section 558.006 RSMo (formerly section 560.031 RSMo).

<sup>2</sup> Section 479.360.1(4); Rule 37.04, Appendix "A," Minimum Operating Standard #2.

<sup>3</sup> See *Bearden v. Georgia*, 461 U.S. 660 (1983); *State ex rel. Fleming v. Mo. Bd. of Prob. & Parole*, 515 S.W.3d 224 (Mo. banc 2017).

<sup>4</sup> U.S. Dep't of Health & Human Servs., Poverty Guidelines, Jan. 26, 2016, (<https://aspe.hhs.gov/poverty-guidelines>).

- c. Financial resources, assets, financial obligations, and dependents;
- d. Whether the person is homeless, incarcerated, or resides in a mental health facility;
- e. Basic living expenses, including, but not limited to, food, rent/mortgage, utilities, medical expenses, transportation, and child support;
- f. The person's efforts to acquire additional resources, including any permanent or temporary limitations to secure paid work due to disability, mental or physical health, homelessness, incarceration, lack of transportation, or driving privileges;
- g. Other LFOs owed to the court or other courts;
- h. Whether LFO payment would result in manifest hardship to the person or his/her dependents; and
- i. Any other special circumstances that may bear on the person's ability to pay.

#### 4. Findings by the Court

**The court should find, on the record and/or by docket entry, that the person was provided prior adequate notice of:**

- a. Hearing date/time;
- b. Failure to pay an LFO is at issue;
- c. The right to counsel\*;
- d. The defense of inability to pay;
- e. The opportunity to bring any documents or other evidence of inability to pay; and
- f. The opportunity to request an alternative sanction to payment or incarceration.

After the ability to pay hearing, the court should also find on the record that the person was given a meaningful opportunity to explain the failure to pay.

**If the Court determines that incarceration must be imposed, the Court should make findings about:**

1. The financial resources relied upon to conclude that nonpayment was willful;<sup>5</sup> or
2. If the defendant/respondent was not at fault for nonpayment, why alternate measures are not adequate, in the particular case, to meet the State's interest in punishment and deterrence.<sup>6</sup>

#### Alternative Sanctions to Imprisonment That Courts Should Consider When There is an Inability to Pay<sup>7</sup>

- a. Reduction of the amount due;
- b. Extension of time to pay;
- c. A reasonable payment plan or modification of an existing payment plan;
- d. Credit for community service (*Caution*: Hours ordered should be proportionate to the violation and take into consideration any disabilities, driving restrictions, transportation limitations, and caregiving and employment responsibilities of the individual);
- e. Credit for completion of a relevant, court-approved program (e.g., education, job skills, mental health or drug treatment); or
- f. Waiver or suspension of the amount due.

\*Case law establishes that the U.S. Constitution affords indigent persons a right to court-appointed counsel in most post-conviction proceedings in which the individual faces actual incarceration for nonpayment of a legal financial obligation, or a suspended sentence of incarceration that would be carried out in the event of future nonpayment, even if the original sanction was only for fines and fees. *See Best Practices for Determining the Right to Counsel in Legal Financial Obligation Cases.*

<sup>5</sup> See, for example, *State v. Jackson*, 610 S.W.2d 420 (Mo. App. 1980).

<sup>6</sup> *Bearden*, 461 U.S. at 672, *Fleming*, 515 S.W.3d at 232.

<sup>7</sup> Section 479.360.1 (8)(9) RSMo; Rule 37.04, Appendix "A," Minimum Operating Standard #2, #4; section 558.006 RSMo (formerly section 560.031 RSMo).